



Remembering the Orly Attack

Maxime GAUIN*

Abstract

The bombing of Orly Airport, on July 15, 1983, one the two bloodiest attacks by Armenian terrorists in the 1970s and 1980s, is not an accident or a crime whose responsibility could be attributed only to a tiny group of extremists. It is rather a logical consequence of a decade of violence. If the trial of 1985 was a great victory against the terrorism, the “recognition” of the “Armenian genocide” claims in the French Parliament, against the dispositions of the French Constitution, was a reward to terrorism, and decisive in securing the release of the main perpetrator of the Orly bombing.

Keywords: ARE, ASALA, Armenian terrorism, Hunchak, JCAG, Orly, Ramkavar.

“ASALA tried to rewrite history with the bomb and the gun, but succeeded only in adding a new bloody chapter to it. Later, Armenian nationalists used Western parliaments in an absurd attempt to rewrite history by legislative process.”

Andrew Mango.¹

INTRODUCTION

“Orly” has remained the symbol of bloody terrorism against Turkey and related targets, but the attack, its roots and its consequences did not receive from scholars the attention which it deserved.

* PhD candidate at Middle East Technical University (METU), Department of History and Researcher at International Strategic Research Organization (USAK)

¹ Andrew Mango, *Turkey and the War on Terror. For Forty Years We Fought Alone*, (London-New York: Routledge, 2005), p. 13.

The Armenian Secret Army for Liberation of Armenia (ASALA) was created in 1971 within the Lebanese branch of the Armenian Revolutionary Federation (ARF-Dashnak), and also with the participation of some members of Hunchak, another Armenian nationalist party.² The ARF lost quickly the control of the group, which was taken over by two Palestinian terrorist leaders: George Habbash (a former admirer of Nazism who turned to far left in the 1960's³) and Waddi Haddad (who became a KGB agent in 1971⁴). As a result, the ARF created in December 1972 its proper terrorist group, the so-called "Justice Commandos Against Armenian Genocide" (JCAG), later named Armenian Revolutionary Army (ARA); to prevent any dissidence, the JCAG/ARA were directly subordinated to the World Bureau of ARF.⁵ The culmination of both ASALA and JCAG attacks took place in the beginning of 1980's.

The worst terrorist attack perpetrated in France since the end of World War II and the worst perpetrated in peace time took place on July 15, 1983.⁶ A bomb placed by the ASALA in Orly Airport (one of the two main airports of the Parisian agglomeration) killed eight tourists (four Frenchmen, two Turks, one American, one Swede), wounded 90, including around 60 seriously, several of who remained infirm for life. As Waroujan Garbidjian (Karapetian), chief of the ASALA in France, sentenced to life for the attack, confessed, the goal was to destroy a plane of Turkish Airlines (and so to kill all its passengers and staff); it is only by accident that the explosion happened in the airport.

² Gaidz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme arméniens*, (Paris: Presses universitaires de France), 2002, pp. 28-29.

³ Pierre Péan and Christophe Nick, *L'Extrémiste. François Genoud, de Hitler à Carlos*, documentary film, 1996, http://www.dailymotion.com/video/x4prsu_l-extremiste-francois-genoud-de-hit_news (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁴ Christopher Andrew and Vasili Mitrokhin, *The World Was Going Our Way: The KGB Battle for the Third World*, (New York: Basic Books, 2005), pp. 246-253. On the Soviet-Palestinian-Armenian connections, see also Yonah Alexander and Joshua Sinai, *Terrorism: the PLO Connection*, (New York-Bristol: C. Russak/Taylor & Francis, 1989), pp. 27 and 187-188; A. Alper Gazigiray, *Ermeni Terörü'nün Kaynakları*, (İstanbul: Gözen Kitabevi, 1982), pp. 572-599 et 612-616; Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just Cause of their People. A Study of Contemporary Armenian Terrorism*, (Westport-New York-London: Greenwood Press, 1986), pp. 92-97; Andrew Mango, *Turkey...*, pp. 12 and 35; Gaidz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 18-23, 27-29, 54-55, 61-62, 73-74 and 106-121; Claire Sterling, *The Terror Network: The Secret War of International Terrorism*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1981), pp. 228-244; Metin Tamkoç, 'International Terrorism: the Russian Connection,' in *International Terrorism and the Drug Connection*, (Ankara: Ankara University Press), 1984, pp. 60-69.

⁵ Gaidz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 22-23, 28, 34 and 87; Francis P. Hyland, *Armenian Terrorism: the Past, the Present, the Prospects*, (Boulder-San Francisco-Oxford: Westview Press, 1991), pp. 61-62; Yves Ternon, *La Cause arménienne*, (Paris: Le Seuil, 1983), pp. 218-221.

⁶ Gaidz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, p. 88.

Arrested on July 20, 1983 and sentenced to life on March 3, 1985, Mr. Garbidjian was released in April 2001. The purpose of this paper, published, in its first and shorter version, on the occasion of the tenth anniversary of his release, is to clarify the context and the consequences of this terrorist attack; particularly, to rectify the various and frequent errors about this crime. The attack is frequently presented as an abnormal event in the Armenian terrorism. It was not; and the sincerity of “critiques” pronounced by the main associations of the Armenian Diaspora is at least questionable. The bombing is also presented as the end, or almost the end, of the Armenian terrorism. It was by no means an end. The trial of 1985 is also inaccurately represented. The importance of the Turkish strategy is underestimated and the role of the non-Turkish victims in the verdict is overestimated. Regardless, the fact remains that the “recognition” of “Armenian genocide” claims in 2001 in practice rewarded the terrorism, including the main perpetrator of the Orly attack.

THE ROAD TO THE BOMBING

The General Context

Armenian terrorism was re-launched in practice by the double murder of Turkish general consul Mehmet Baydar and his deputy Bahadır Demir, perpetrated by Gourgen Yanikian (the ASALA’s inspiration) on January 27, 1973, in Santa Barbara.⁷ Yanikian himself stressed on the racist motivation of his crime, in saying and repeating that he killed in fact no human, but “just destroyed two evils”.⁸

Gourgen Yanikian quickly received a strong support from a substantial part of the Armenian American community, especially in California. An association named “American Friends of Armenian Martyrs” is created in March 1973; some of its leaders were formerly in charge of the construction of the first “Armenian genocide” monument in USA, built and inaugurated in Montebello, in 1965-1968. \$ 50,000, from mostly small donations (around ten dollars), was collected.⁹ Both *The Armenian Mirror-Spectator* (Ramkavar) and *Asbarez* (Dashnak) published appeals to donate money for Yanikian’s legal defense.¹⁰ Armenian associations in Los Angeles rented buses which sent children aged 7-13 to attend the trial and celebrate Yanikian as a “hero”.¹¹ According to the French journalist of Armenian heritage Pierre Terzian “the overwhelming

⁷ Michael Bobelian, *Children of Armenia*, (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2009), pp. 141-163; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız (1973-1994)*, (Ankara: Bilgi Yayınevi, 2000), tome I, pp. 80-117.

⁸ Michael Bobelian, *Children of Armenia...*, pp. 154 and 158.

⁹ *Ibid*, pp. 149-150.

¹⁰ *The Armenian Mirror-Spectator*, March 24, 1973; *Asbarez* April 24 and May 15, 1973.

¹¹ Sworn Statement of Beliz Berkoz, August 28, 2000. http://www.ataa.org/reference/topalian/VIS6_Berkoz_Affidavit.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

majority of Armenians approved the attack perpetrated in California in January 1973.”¹² Despite this mobilization, the prosecutor David D. Minier and the president of the tribunal John Westwick refused to listen the “Armenian genocide” claims, arguing that the job of the court was to judge a racist crime, not to take position on historical controversies; Yanikian was sentenced to a life term in prison, both in the first instance and in appeal.¹³ Gourgen Yanikian was however considered by many Armenians, especially in California, as a “hero” far after his condemnation. He received kind letters and gifts until his deaths, and, despite having virtually no more family or personal friends in USA, several hundreds of Armenian American attended to his obsequies.¹⁴ *The Armenian Weekly* echoed several times — especially around the time of the Orly attack — the crude racism of Yanikian, explicitly presenting the Turks as an inferior race, a people “unequaled in his barbarity”, “terrorist” (sic), with “ferocious customs”, and so naturally inclined to “exterminate the whole Armenian race”.¹⁵

The support from the Armenian communities and the Soviet secret services is more understandable in considering the crucial role of Russia in the development of Armenian nationalism and terrorism during the Ottoman time, and also the continuity of the methods employed by the Armenian terrorists in 19th and 20th centuries.¹⁶ Mikael Varandian, the main ideologue of the ARF-Dashnak from the 1900’s until his death (1934) wrote that “Perhaps there has never been a revolutionary party — not even the Russian Narodovolets, or the Italian Carbonari — with such rich experience on the road of terrorist acts, as the Armenian Revolutionary Federation, which in its difficult environment has developed the most frenzied types of terrorists and given hundreds of masters of

¹² Pierre Terzian, ‘La question arménienne aujourd’hui’, *Critique socialiste*, n° 44, 1982.

¹³ Text of the appeal verdict: <http://law.justia.com/cases/california/calapp3d/39/366.html> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

¹⁴ *Armenian Atrocities and Terrorism*, (Washington: ATAA, 1997), <http://www.ataa.org/reference/Armenian-Atrocities.pdf> (Accessed on May 6, 2011); Stephen Segaller, *Invisible Armies. Terrorism into the 1990’s*, (London: Sphere Books/Penguin Books, 1987), p. 66.

¹⁵ See, for instance, the issues of June 1, 1983, p. 42 and June 30, p. 2.

¹⁶ Türkaya Ataöv, ‘Procurement of Arms for Armenian Terrorists: Realities Based on Ottoman Documents,’ Paul B. Henze, ‘The Roots of Armenian Violence,’ and Heath Lowry, ‘Nineteenth and Twentieth Century Armenian Terrorism: ‘Threads of Continuity’,’ in *International Terrorism and the Drug Connection*, (Ankara: Ankara University Press), 1984,, pp. 71-83 and 169-202; Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, pp. 29-30 and 55; William L. Langer, *The Diplomacy of Imperialism. 1890-1902*, (New York: Alfred A. Knopf), 1960, pp. 150-160 and 204-210; Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 1 and 32; Kapriel Seropé Papazian, *Patriotism Perverted*, (Boston: Baïkar Press, 1934), pp. 13-21, 24, 38 and 57-73; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome I, pp. 29-77; Yves Ternon, *La Cause arménienne...*, pp. 124-125; Felix Valyi, *Spiritual and Political Revolutions in Islam*, (London: Kegan Paul, 1925), pp. 29-33 et 139-236, <http://ia600308.us.archive.org/30/items/spiritualandpoli029564mbp/spiritualandpoli029564mbp.pdf> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

the pistol, the bomb and the dagger”.¹⁷ Varandian also developed a virulent anti-Turkish and anti-Kurdish racism.¹⁸ Sarkis Atamian, a leader of the ARF in the USA during the 1950’s, wrote: “It is a fact that a nucleus of persons have been trained in terroristic tactics and almost any definitive Dashnak literature contains long lists of persons liquidated or executed”.¹⁹ The Hunchak party has a similar background.²⁰

The ASALA, which openly considered Gourgen Yanikian as its inspiration, officially started its attacks in January 1975 (but likely as early as 1973, under the name of “Yanikian Commandos”); the JCAG began on October 22, 1975, with the assassination of Daniş Tunalıgil, the Turkish ambassador in Vienna.²¹

The French Case

After Turkey, France was the country who suffered the most from Armenian terrorism: 18 peoples were killed on French soil from 1975 to 1983.²² But the

¹⁷ Quoted and translated in Kapriel S. Papazian, *Patriotism Perverted...*, p. 18.

¹⁸ Mikael Varandian, *L’Arménie et la question arménienne*, (Laval: G. Kavanagh & Cie, 1917), pp. 23-30. For a similar racism in the Dashnak press, see *Aspirations et agissements révolutionnaires des comités arméniens, avant et après la proclamation de la Constitution ottomane*, (Istanbul : Matbaai Orhaniye, 1917), p. 155, http://louisville.edu/a-s/history/turks/comites_armeniens.pdf

¹⁹ Sarkis Atamian, *The Armenian Community. The Historical Development of a Social and Ideological Conflict*, (New York: Philosophical Library, 1955), p. 276.

²⁰ Hratch Dasnabedian, ‘The Hnchakian Party,’ *Armenian Review*, XLI-4, Winter 1988, pp. 17-39; Kámuran Gürün, *The Armenian File. The Myth of Innocence Exposed*, (Istanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, 2007) (1st English edition, Nicosia, 1985), pp. 156-159 and 169-196, <http://www.eraren.org/index.php?Lisan=en&Page=YayinIcerik&SayiNo=19> (Accessed on May 6, 2011); Louise Nalbandian, *The Armenian Revolutionary Movement. The Development of Armenian Political Parties Through the Nineteenth Century*, (Berkeley-Los Angeles-London: University of California Press, 1963), pp. 110-111, 120-121 and 127-128 <http://www.ucpress.edu/op.php?isbn=9780520009141> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

²¹ ATAA, *Report on Armenian Terrorism and JCAG Terrorist Hampig Sassounian*, p. 23 http://www.ataa.org/reference/Supporting_Documents_Hampig_Sassounian.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011); Gaidz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, p. 44; Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, pp. 33 and 68.

²² Namely six Turkish diplomats and staff members (the Turkish ambassador İsmail Erez and his driver, on October 24, 1975, the tourism attaché Yılmaz Çolpan on December 22, 1979, the counselors Reşat Morali and Tecelli Arı on March 4, 1981, and the guardian Cemal Özen on September 24, 1981), two Turks in the consulate of Lyon, on August 5, 1980, one French secretary, Renée Morin, in the bombing of the Marmara agency (see below), eight persons in the Orly attack, one in the bombing of an exposition hall in Marseille, on October 1st, 1983. In addition, Selçuk Bakkalbaşı, press counselor of the Turkish embassy, remained paralyzed for the rest of his life because an attempt of assassination by ASALA on September 26, 1980. See Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, pp. 68-69 ; Gaidz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, p. 44; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, pp. 156-190, 300-312, 378-405 and 424-458; Global Terrorism Database <http://www.start.umd.edu/gtd/search/IncidentSummary.aspx?gtid=198310010001> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

existence of an important Armenian community in France is not the single reason of this exceptionally bloody situation. After 1979 and the rise of ASALA, there was a contest between the political branch of this group on one side, and the ARF on the other, for the control of the Armenian community in France. The significant popularity of the terrorism, especially among the most active Armenians, led ASALA to increase, again and again, the number and the severity of terrorist attacks, especially in France. Due to the arrest of Dashnak terrorist Max Hraïr Kilndjian in 1980, and the victory of Socialists in national elections of 1981, the ARF preferred to stop its attacks in France — which did not mean discontinuing the terrorism in other countries.²³ According to Edward K. Boghosian, editor of *The Armenian Reporter*, the terrorism of the ASALA and JCAG “rallied the Armenian community of France, regarded up to 1975 as dormant and well on its way to complete assimilation within French society.”²⁴

In addition to the competition between JCAG/ARA and ASALA, the questionable conduct of the trials of two Armenian terrorists was, in practice, encouragements to continue and escalate the violence. Indicted for attempted murder against the Turkish ambassador in Switzerland, the Dashnak Max Hraïr Kilndjian was sentenced as only as accomplice, to two years in jail, by the tribunal of Aix-en-Provence. The witnesses of the attack were threatened to death, so only one dared to go Aix-en-Provence. The lawyers of Mr. Kilndjian argued mostly on “genocide” allegations, and were helped by several witnesses, including the main self-proclaimed historians who diffused the “Armenian genocide” allegation in France: Jean-Marie Carzou (Zouloumian), Gérard Chaliand (Chalian) and Yves Ternon. Gerard Libaridian, actually the director of the Zoryan Institute, travelled from the USA just to testify for Mr. Kilndjian; Richard G. Hovannisian sent a written statement. The lawyer of the Turkish ambassador received no contra-genocide argument, and so, focused on the case itself and on the danger of terrorism.²⁵ A huge Dashnak crowd attended the trial, to intimidate the jury and the magistrates. The line of the ARF was clearly expressed from the very beginning: “Guilty or not, we support Max Kilndjian”.²⁶ It is not needed to say that Mr. Kilndjian’s slight sentence was welcomed with a great enthusiasm by the Dashnaks. Every issue of *Haiïastan*, the monthly of young Dashnaks (Nor Seround) in France, was full of articles vehemently supporting Mr. Kilndjian, from 1980 to 1982. But at least the ARF considered that the necessary complementary counterpart of such an arrogant and aggressive attitude was to end the terrorist attacks in France.

²³ Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 63, 65-66 and 69-76.

²⁴ ‘The Armenian Community in France: A Potential Force,’ *The Armenian Reporter*, February 2, 1984, p. 1.

²⁵ See the proceedings of the trial, published by ARF: Comité de soutien à Max Kilndjian, *Les Arméniens en cour d’assises. Terroristes ou résistants ?*, (Marseille: Parenthèses, 1983).

²⁶ Yves Ternon, *La Cause arménienne...*, pp. 223-224.

However, the ASALA was of a different opinion. To obtain the release of its terrorists, the ASALA extensively used the intimidation and blackmail by bombings and threats of bombings. But interestingly, the same staff of lawyers defended the ASALA and JCAG terrorists in France and Switzerland, except for the Orly attack, and this exception is mainly due to the decision of the ASALA itself. The “Comité de soutien aux prisonniers politiques arméniens” (CSPPA, “Support Committee for Armenian Political Prisoners”), in charge of paying the lawyers’s costs, was led by Jean-Marc “Ara” Toranian, who was also the chairman of the Mouvement national arménien (MNA), a group which was the political branch of ASALA until 1983.²⁷ The CSPPA supported indicted terrorists from both ASALA and JCAG.

Tried for the bombing of a Parisian office of Turkish Airlines, in January 1983, the ASALA terrorist Abraham Thomassian was sentenced, on July 7 of the same year, to only 30 months of jail. Monte Melkonian revealed later that Hagop Hagopian inadvertently gave to Mr. Thomassian offensive grenades, instead of defensive, i.e. much less dangerous explosives, only by ignorance; that is why nobody was killed.²⁸ However, the goal was actually, like in Orly, to kill maximum number of people. By comparison, another ASALA terrorist, Zaven Bedros, was sentenced on July 23, 1983 by a London tribunal to eight years in prison for illegal storing of weapons and explosives and conspiracy to take the Turkish ambassador hostage.²⁹

Orly or the Culmination of Blind Terrorism

On February 28, 1983, the ASALA bombed an office of the travel agency Marmara, a French company, killing one French secretary and wounding four other French citizens. *Hay Baykar*, the newspaper edited by Mr. Toranian, slammed only those who called this act “terrorist” and “criminal,” and considered the bombing as completely excusable; *Hay Baykar* insinuated even that those who condemned these acts were motivated by anti-Armenian “racism”.³⁰ This attack was not the first successful blind bombing by the ASALA. As early as March 10, 1980, a bomb killed two people and wounded at least twelve others, mostly Italians, at the Turkish Airlines office of Rome.³¹ No

²⁷ Gaidz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 45 and 65-66; Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, pp. 35 and 105.

²⁸ ‘L’ASALA sur et contre elle-même’, *Notes et études de l’institut de criminologie de Paris*, n° 11-12, October 1989. http://www.drmcc.org/download_statique.php?dl=ne11_12.pdf

²⁹ Armand Gaspard (Gasparian), *Le Combat arménien*, (Lausanne: L’Âge d’homme), 1984, p. 78; Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, pp. 81-82; Francis P. Hyland, *Armenian Terrorism...*, p. 210.

³⁰ *Hay Baykar*, March 17, 1983.

³¹ Global Terrorism Database <http://www.start.umd.edu/gtd/search/IncidentSummary.aspx?gtdid=>

one perpetrator was arrested; it was the same for all the other attacks perpetrated by the Armenian terrorists in Austria, Belgium, Bulgaria, Germany, Italy, Lebanon, Spain, Portugal and the Vatican.

On August 7, 1982, a suicide-attack of the ASALA at Ankara Airport killed nine tourists (including one German and one American) and wounded 71 others (including one American).³² *Hay Baykar* presented warm congratulations to the ASALA for this carnage, “incontrovertibly the most important action of the last seven years of fighting”, and the beginning of “a new step in the fight for liberation”.³³ One month before the Orly attack, the ASALA committed a suicide attack in Istanbul’s bazaar, killing two persons (the ASALA claimed twenty-five) and wounded twenty-three.³⁴ One more time, *Hay Baykar* praised the crime: “Meguerditch Madarian fell as martyr in the flower of his youth, an image of Armenian youth which despair and cynicism about the success of our cause have led the most awful, the most insane sacrifice — Madarian, dead on the enemy’s soil.”³⁵

Similarly, in its issue of November 24, 1982, *Hay Baykar* published an article entitled “Notre lutte et l’opinion publique” (“Our Struggle and the Public Opinion”), recommending to Armenian terrorists to commit criminal acts well beyond the assassination of only Turkish diplomats, and to not take too much care of the public opinion’s reactions. The perpetrators of the Orly bombing did nothing but to follow these recommendations. The crime of Orly was the absolute logical consequence of the preceding bombings, of the encouraging comments made by the ASALA’s political branch, and of the lack of efficient repression against terrorist acts, especially in France.

But the Orly attack provoked the quick dismantlement of ASALA in France. Yves Bonnet, head of the Direction de la surveillance du territoire (DST, French counter-terrorist and counter-intelligence police) received the green light from the government for an operation which he hoped to organize since his nomination, in 1982: the arrest of the whole ASALA network in France, by a coordinated operation of all the national police forces.

198003100033 (Accessed on May 2, 2011); Sedat Laçiner, *Ermeni Sorunu, Diaspora ve Türk Dış Politikası*, (Ankara: USAK, 2008), p. 251.

³² Global Terrorism Database <http://www.start.umd.edu/gtd/search/IncidentSummary.aspx?gtdid=198208080008> (Accessed on May 2, 2011)

³³ *Hay Baykar*, September 29, 1982, and February 10, 1983.

³⁴ Michael M. Gunter, ‘*Pursuing the Just...*’, pp. 70-71.

³⁵ Quoted in Stephen Segaller, *Invisible Armies...*, p. 68.

THE REACTIONS OF THE MAIN ARMENIAN DIASPORA ASSOCIATIONS: “CRITIQUES” CONTRADICTED BY FACTS

According to the French association named “SOS-attentats”, the official condemnation of the Orly bombing by the French Armenian associations was published only “more than one year” after the event.³⁶ It is not the only reason to doubt of the sincerity of the “condemnation” of this attack.

The Revolutionaries

The medal of hypocrisy has surely to be awarded to Mr. Toranian’s MNA, not only because the MNA, as we saw, supported fully the strategy of the ASALA until the Orly attack. Indeed, *Hay Baykar*, despite its so-called “critique” of the Orly attack, claimed impunity for the perpetrators, and slammed the verdict life imprisonment for Waroujan Garbidjian, 15 years of jail for Soner Nayir, 10 years for Ohannes Semerci), saying: “the rise of the anti-Armenian repression, which we denounce tirelessly for months, culminated this Sunday March 3, 3 a.m. [...] These three condemnations are a new blow to the Armenian cause.”³⁷ *Hay Baykar* also unconditionally supported Soner Nayir³⁸, who designed the firing circuits of the bomb used in Orly.³⁹ There is more direct and concrete evidence of compromising. One member of MNA was sentenced to jail for concealment of criminal (i.e. Soner Nayir). Mr. Toranian himself was sentenced to four months of suspended jail, but acquitted by the appeal court: he gave money to a friend, who used this money to help Soner Nayir; the first-instance court decided that Mr. Toranian could not completely ignore the destination of his money, the appeal court gave him the benefit of doubt.

Similarly, Mr. Toranian stated in an interview to *Le Nouvel Observateur*, in 1986, that Hagop Hagopian, the chief of ASALA, was a “fascist” and an “anti-Semite”⁴⁰, failing to explain why his newspaper and his association supported this “fascist” during several years — including the time (1979-1980) the ASALA bombed the office of El Al in Rome airport, and stated that the “Zionist Jews” are, with “Zionist Turkey”, the main enemies of the Armenians.⁴¹ *Hay Baykar*

³⁶ Official Web site of SOS-attentats: http://www.sos-attentats.org/fiche-temoignage-reaction.asp?id={D7B3D942-B91C-4C0A-8C55-B709AC73F6F2}&c=Temoignages&lan_id=fr (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

³⁷ *Hay Baykar*, March 11, 1985.

³⁸ *Hay Baykar*, October 13 and 27, 1983; March 11, 1985.

³⁹ Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, p. 81.

⁴⁰ ‘La dérive sanglante de l’ASALA’, *Le Nouvel Observateur*, October 17, 1986, p. 46, http://referentiel.nouvelobs.com/archives_pdf/OBS1145_19861017/OBS1145_19861017_046.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁴¹ Global Terrorism Database <http://www.start.umd.edu/gtd/search/IncidentSummary.aspx?gtdid=198002180004> (Accessed on May 6, 2011) ; Sedat Laçiner, *Ermeni Sorunu Diaspora...*, p. 251; Stephen Segaller, *Invisible Armies...*, pp. 69-70.

even said that the survival of the Armenian people depended on ASALA.⁴² Mr. Toranian failed also to say why, as editor-in-chief of *Hay Baykar*, he allowed the publication of several articles which called the Israeli government and the whole Jewish population of Israel “terrorists” and “Nazis”⁴³, a comparison which is a classical topic of Arab and Iranian anti-Semitism.⁴⁴

The so-called “critique” of the Orly attack did not mean the end of appeals to terrorism by the MNA. Quite the contrary, the group became in practice the political side of the dissident terrorists of the ASALA-Revolutionary Movement what it was to the ASALA prior to Orly attack. Only the arrests of its members by the French police prevented the ASALA-RM from committing crimes on French soil.⁴⁵ During the trial of Monte Melkonian, chief of the ASALA-RM, for possession of a fake passport, illegal storing of weapons and conspiracy, Mr. Toranian himself testified for the terrorist, and justified his crimes.

The Armenian Revolutionary Federation was roughly as self-contradictory as the MNA in “condemning” the Orly attack. It is indeed a legend that the Dashnak terrorists of the JCAG/ARA refrained from using bombs in public and non-diplomatic locations. Quite the contrary, the JCAG carried out the first bombings of this kind, on May 29, 1977, in Yeşilköy (today Atatürk) Airport and the Sirkeci railroad station of Istanbul (5 deaths, 64 wounded).⁴⁶ An even more serious attempt occurred in October 1982. The FBI arrested at the time five Dashnak terrorists (“LA 5”) who wanted to blow up the whole building where the Turkish Honorary Consulate of Philadelphia is located. According to FBI estimates, approved by the appeal court, the bomb would have caused “at least 100 casualties. A daytime explosion could inflict as many as 2,000 to 3,000 casualties.”⁴⁷ The extent of the crime did not repel the traditional support of the legal branches of the ARF to the JCAG. Speaking on behalf of the Armenian National Committee of America (ANCA, political branch of the ARF), local representative Leon Kirakosian “condemned this effort by the FBI and local police agencies to do Turkish dirty work against the Armenian people.”⁴⁸ The ARF chapter of California collected in one night \$ 110,000 to pay the lawyer’s costs of the “LA 5”. In Canada alone, the ARF collected \$ 160,000.⁴⁹ The chief of

⁴² *Hay Baykar*, Summer 1979 (editorial). See also the issue of April 19, 1982.

⁴³ See, especially, *Hay Baykar*, April 19 and September 29, 1982; and March 4, 1983.

⁴⁴ Bernard Lewis, ‘Muslim Anti-Semitism,’ *The Middle East Quarterly*, Vol. V, n° 2, June 1998, pp. 43-49, <http://www.meforum.org/396/muslim-anti-semitism> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁴⁵ Michael M. Gunter, ‘*Pursuing the Just...*’, pp. 49-53.

⁴⁶ Armand Gaspard (Gasparian), *Le Combat arménien...*, p. 75; Yves Yernon, *La Cause arménienne...*, p. 221.

⁴⁷ Text of the appeal verdict <http://ftp.resource.org/courts.gov/c/F2/841/841.F2d.959.85-5037-5039.html> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁴⁸ ATAA, *Report on Armenian ...*, p. 51.

⁴⁹ *The Armenian Weekly*, November 19, 1983, p. 1 and 10 December 1983, p. 5.

the group, Vicken Hovsepien, who was sentenced to six years of prison (the prosecutor asked 25 years),⁵⁰ is currently a member of ARF's World Bureau and the supreme representative of the ARF in the USA. Before 1983, the ARF saw no need to "condemn" any act of the ASALA; in autumn 1982, during a series of ARF's meetings in France, the participants rejected explicitly the idea to "put the ASALA on trial"; the single shortcoming of ASALA, according to them, was to refuse a united front with the ARF.⁵¹

The Orly attack did not dissuade the ARF to continue terrorism, including attempts to bombing in public places. On July 27, 1983, the JCAG/ARA perpetrated a suicide attack against the Turkish embassy in Lisbon, killing the wife of the deputy chief of mission and a Portuguese policeman, and wounding another — a crime enthusiastically celebrated every year by the ARF, despite the failure of the terrorists, who wanted to kill the ambassador himself.⁵² During the year 1984, ARA assassinated two Turkish diplomats, Erdoğan Özen and Evner Ergün, both in Vienna;⁵³ two ARA's terrorists were killed by their own bomb, accidentally, in the car park of the Topkapı Palace, in Istanbul⁵⁴ — a touristic place where non-Turkish tourists could have been very likely victims if the bombing had been successful. On March 12, 1985, the ARA carried out its most organized attack, against the Turkish embassy in Ottawa, but failed only because of the sacrifice of the security guard Claude Brunelle and the significant number of Pinkerton agents who protected the embassy.⁵⁵ The cold-blooded murder of a non-Turkish citizen did not prevent the ARF, of course, to present its three criminals (sentenced to life) as "heroes".⁵⁶

The meetings organized by the ARF in Paris, Lyon and Marseille, in the end of 1985, about "Ten years of armed struggle" showed that activists of the ARF

⁵⁰ Bruce Fein, 'Armenian Terrorism with a North American Component: Sentencing Examples,' p. 3, in ATAA, *Victims' Impact Statement*, 2000, http://www.ataa.org/reference/topalian/ATAA_Victim_Impact_Pleading.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁵¹ 'Mise au point et bilan de sept années d'actions armées', *Haïastan*, October 1982.

⁵² Michael M. Gunter, 'Pursuing the Just...', pp. 56-60; Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 90-93; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome II, pp. 714-743. The first-hand evidences of celebrations are too numerous to be mentioned all here. See, for instance, *The Armenian Weekly*, October 15, 1983, January 14 and February 11, 1984, July 17, 1993; 'L'agenda', *France-Arménie*, July 16, 2008; 'Community Remembers Sacrifice of Lisbon 5,' *Asbarez*, August 1st, 2008.

⁵³ Michael M. Gunter, 'Pursuing the Just...', p. 69; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome II, pp. 780-815.

⁵⁴ Global Terrorism Database <http://www.start.umd.edu/gtd/search/IncidentSummary.aspx?gtid=198409030001> (Accessed on May 6, 2011); Michael M. Gunter, 'Pursuing the Just...', p. 63; Francis P. Hyland, *Armenian Terrorism...*, p. 219.

⁵⁵ Francis P. Hyland, *Armenian Terrorism...*; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome II, pp. 943-961.

⁵⁶ See for instance, the official Web site of the ARF's French branch: http://www.fra-france.com/print_article.php?id=57 (Accessed on May 3, 2011).

sought the continuation of terrorism, and not at all its discarding.⁵⁷ In the end of 1986, *The Armenian Weekly*, official publication of the ARF in Boston (Massachusetts), published an article asserting that the Armenians can “only be excited by these acts of violence, as ‘acts of creation’ since the destruction of any representative of the Oppressor, Turkey, means the assertion of Armenian dignity”.⁵⁸ According to Gaïdz Minassian’s account of the ARF’s congresses which decided to suspend the activities of ARA for one year (1985) then adjourn (1986), the arguments used by the partisans of suspension — chiefly Hrach Dasnabedian (1928-2001) — did not mention the Orly attack, but instead above all practical reasons. It was because the terrorism was getting increasingly expensive, as the effectiveness of the polices in the countries where Dashnak terrorist acts were perpetrated and the pressure of various governments were increased. Mr. Minassian also offered this interesting note: the ARF’s specialists in explosives were sent, from 1985-1986, to the camps of PKK, an ally of the Dashnak Party⁵⁹, and also one of the most criminal and violent terrorist groups in the world.⁶⁰ There are even reasons to doubt of the sincerity of the suspension of the terrorist activities in 1985-1986. Indeed, the JCAG carried out two attacks in Australia, against the Turkish general consulate in Melbourne (November 24, 1986) and at a mail sorting facility in Brisbane (January 19, 1987).⁶¹ Without the JCAG label, the ARF organized, in July 1993, the assassination of two Russian officials, General Safonov and A. Polyanichko.⁶² And in 1996, the US police discovered an arsenal of the JCAG in a garage rented by Mourad Topalian, actually president of the Armenian National Committee of

⁵⁷ ‘Dix ans de lutte armée’, *Haïastan*, December 1985.

⁵⁸ Aram Khaligian, ‘The Necessities of Violence and National Culture in the Liberation Struggle,’ *The Armenian Weekly*, December 31, 1986, p. 15.

⁵⁹ Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 74, 108-109, 116 and 194. On the Soviet-Armenian-PKK connection, see also Michael M. Gunter, ‘Transnational Sources of Support for the Kurdish Insurgency in Turkey,’ *Conflict Quarterly*, n° 11, Spring 1991, pp. 16-22, https://lib.unb.ca/Texts/JCS/CQ/vol011_2spring1991/gunter (Accessed on May 4, 2011).

⁶⁰ Soner Çağaptay, ‘Can the PKK Renounce to Violence? Terrorism Resurgent,’ *The Middle East Quarterly*, Vol. XIV, n° 1, Winter 2007, pp. 45-52, <http://www.meforum.org/1060/can-the-pkk-renounce-violence> (Accessed on May 4, 2011); Sedat Laçiner, ‘Drug Smuggling as Main Source of PKK Terrorism,’ *The Journal of Turkish Weekly*, October 18, 2008, <http://www.turkishweekly.net/columnist/2994/drug-smuggling-as-main-source-of-pkk-terrorism.html> (Accessed on May 4, 2011); Andrew Mango, *Turkey...*, pp. 31-57.

⁶¹ Heath Lowry, ‘Chronological Breakdown of Armenian Terrorist Incidents, 1973-1987,’ in *Armenian Allegations: Myth and Reality. A Handbook of facts and Documents*, (Washington: ATAA, 1987); Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, p. 117; Global Terrorism Database, <http://www.start.umd.edu/gtd/search/IncidentSummary.aspx?gtdid=198611230005> (Accessed on May 4, 2011); Press review, <http://armenians-1915.blogspot.com/2007/04/1568-terror-attack-in-toorak.html> (Accessed on May 4, 2011)

⁶² ‘Un représentant de Boris Eltsine tué dans le Caucase du Nord’, *Le Monde*, August 3, 1993; Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, p. 262.

American (ANCA), the Dashnak lobby in the USA. Mr. Topalian was sentenced in 2001 to 37 months in jail and \$ 6,000 fine for illegal storing of war weapons and explosives, in relation to a terrorist group. The investigation demonstrated conclusively that the arsenal was a great threat for the neighborhood, the garage being located close to an important road, a gasoline station and a school.⁶³ Mr. Topalian nevertheless received an unconditional support from the ARF, which included paying his trial costs.⁶⁴

The Hunchak party was also not very convincing in “condemning” the Orly attack. An official of this political organization said in the spring of 1982, regarding the ASALA’s attacks, that “actually our party is not against these operations; on the contrary, we support them.”⁶⁵ This statement, which occurred after the first blinding and murderous bombing by the ASALA, made a particular sense, because two of the four ASALA terrorists who attacked the Turkish Consulate in Paris were ex-members of the Hunchak party.⁶⁶

The Ramkavar and the Independent Armenian Groups

Unlike the ARF, the political party Ramkavar did not have a terrorist branch, and unlike Hunchak, there were no explicit statements in favor of terrorism and involving the party itself. But individuals and local groups were totally allowed to support terrorists by words and by donating money to pay their lawyers’ costs; and as far as 2000, when the main columnist of the Ramkavar in the USA, Moorad Mooradian (1935-2009), recalled Armenian terrorism, he justified the assassinations of Turkish diplomats and said absolutely nothing, not a single word of criticism regarding the Orly attack, or any other bombing in public places.⁶⁷ Speaking shortly after the Orly attack, Larry Cretan, former director of the Ramkavar-dominated Armenian Assembly of America (AAA), said “I am disturbed by those kinds of acts because I feel they’re counterproductive,” — so not because they were criminal — and added he could “understand the motivations behind them.”⁶⁸

The Armenian Reporter, an Armenian American daily independent of any political parties, was probably more sincere, because he started to criticize

⁶³ ‘Armenian Terrorists at Work in USA,’ *NBC*, 2005, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=a1c_5APvto (Accessed on May 3, 2011); legal file of ATAA on the Topalian affair: <http://www.ataa.org/reference/topalian/> (Accessed on May 3, 2011).

⁶⁴ ‘Topalian Charged With Pursuing Armenian Cause by Force,’ *Asbarez*, October 19, 1999; ‘Topalian Defense Committee Established,’ *Asbarez*, December 3, 1999; ‘\$25,000 Raised for Topalian Fund during the Fresno Independence Event,’ *Asbarez*, June 2, 2000.

⁶⁵ *Hay Baykar*, April 19, 1982.

⁶⁶ Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, p. 78.

⁶⁷ Moorad Mooradian, ‘Turkish Groups’ Stereotyping Old Hat for Deniers,’ *The Armenian Mirror-Spectator*, March 25, 2000.

⁶⁸ *The California Courier*, August 4, 1983, p. 2.

terrorism before the Orly attack; however, these critics should not be overestimated. Indeed, until 1982, *The Armenian Reporter* accepted to publish articles inciting to murder and terrorism, including some statements of ASALA.⁶⁹ The daily agreed to criticize any terrorist act committed after the carnage of Ankara airport, and this carnage itself, but integrally maintained his praising of the majority of terrorist acts committed before the summer of 1982. Especially, in its March 8, 1984 issue, *The Armenian Reporter* published, in the first page, an obituary of Gourgen Yanikian, saying that Yanikian, in perpetrating his double murder, “opened [a] new era of political struggle” and “changed the course of Armenian history.”

The Consensus to Support Other Terrorists

Support to terrorism by Armenian groups and individuals — Dashnaks and non-Dashnaks — in France reached its peak following the Orly attack, from January to February 1984, i.e. around the trial of the four ASALA terrorists who attacked the Turkish Consulate in Paris on September 24, 1981. They had killed one guard, Cemal Özen, and seriously wounded the consul, Kaya İnal. A crowd of nationalist Armenians attended the trial to intimidate the jury, the prosecutor and the plaintiffs’ representatives; the famous singer Charles Aznavour and the film maker Henri Verneuil (Achod Malakian) sent written statements of support, together with other Armenian personalities; the trio Jean-Marie Carzou (Zouloumian), Gérard Chaliand (Chalian) and Yves Ternon testified one more time; the light verdict (seven years in jail for every terrorists) was slammed as too severe by Armenian newspapers.⁷⁰ The trial of Hampig Sassounian (murderer of the consul general in Los Angeles Kemal Arikian), in the beginning of 1984, in the USA, marked also the paroxysm of support from the ARF, its activists and sympathizers, for terrorism.⁷¹ As late as February 1985, one year and a half after the Orly attack and few days before the trial of this crime, the Armenian American journalist George Mason wrote, with regret: “There are many Armenian Americans in California who feel great sympathy for the Armenian terrorists. I have talked to numerous peaceful, fair and thoughtful men who have expressed support for the terrorists.”⁷²

⁶⁹ For instance: John D. Hagopian, ‘We Will Never Forget,’ *The Armenian Reporter*, January 23, 1982; ‘ASALA’s A. Yenikomshian Addresses New Year’s Message to Armenians,’ *The Armenian Reporter*, January 26, 1982.

⁷⁰ *Armenian Terrorism and the Paris Trial*, (University of Ankara, 1984), http://www.turquie-news.fr/IMG/pdf/TERORISME_ARMENIAN_ET_PROCES_DE_PARIS.pdf (Accessed on May 2, 2011); *Libération*, February 2, 1984; *France-Arménie*, February 21, 1984; *Hay Baykar*, all the issues of January and February 1984; Michael M. Gunter, ‘Pursuing the Just...’, p. 107; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome I, pp. 424-458.

⁷¹ See, especially, *The Armenian Weekly*, January 14, 21 and 28, February 11, 1984; on the support to Hampig Sassounian in France, see *Haiastan*, June 1982, and the special issue on the Sassounian affair, February 1984.

⁷² *The California Courier*, February 7, 1985, p. 8.

The near disappearance of Armenian terrorism in the USA after 1982 (the main exception being the attempt of assassination against Bonnie Joy Kaslan, in the spring of 1985⁷³) has nothing to do with the Orly attack and everything to do with the efficient operations of the FBI⁷⁴ following the assassination of Honorary Consul in Boston Orhan Gündüz⁷⁵ and the strong protests of Ankara to Washington. As we saw before, the end of the Armenian terrorism in France is due to similar causes. The attacks by the ASALA continued in other countries. For instance, several attacks took place in Iran in March and April 1984, killing one Turkish national and wounding two others; the ambassador of Turkey in Budapest was victim of an attempt of assassination on December 19, 1991.⁷⁶ From 1988 to 1994, a second campaign of Armenian terror targeted Azerbaijan, in the context of the Armenian-Azeri conflict.⁷⁷ The continuity between the anti-Turkish terrorism and the aggression against Azerbaijan is exemplified by Monte Melkonian, ASALA leader until 1983, chief of the dissident ASALA-RM until his arrest, and eventually commander of an Armenian unit during the war against the Azeris. Melkonian was killed during a clash in 1993.

THE TRIAL: THE SUCCESS OF TRUTH, COURAGE AND COHERENCE

Change of Franco-Turkish Context, Change of Strategy

The political context of the Armenian issue and the approach to terrorism in France improved quickly after the trial of January 1984 and the vehement Turkish protestats. François Mitterrand realized indeed his serious error to call the fate of Ottoman Armenians as “genocide” during a speech given in the beginning of 1984, for electoral reasons. As a result, in July 1984, when he changed largely his government, almost all the pro-Armenian ministers lost their position, or changed their affectations. Namely, the Minister of Foreign Affairs Claude Cheysson (François Mitterrand said: “Cheysson brought me close

⁷³ Sworn Statement of Bonnie J. Kaslan, September 25, 2000. http://www.ataa.org/reference/topalian/VIS3_Kaslan_Affidavit.pdf (Accessed on May 2, 2011).

⁷⁴ Bonnie Cordes, ‘Armenian Terrorism in America,’ in *International Terrorism and the Drug Connection*, (Ankara: Ankara University Press), p. 164; Michael M. Gunter, ‘Pursuing the Just...’, p. 77. See also Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, pp. 76-77.

⁷⁵ On this murder: Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome II, pp. 500-523.

⁷⁶ ‘HONGRIE — L’ambassadeur de Turquie échappe à un attentat’, *Le Monde*, December 21, 1991 ; ‘HONGRIE — Deux policiers blessés dans un attentat visant des juifs soviétiques’, *Le Monde*, December 25, 1991 ; Francis P. Hyland, *Armenian Terrorism...*, p. 50; Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, p. 96; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, pp. 746-778; Global Terrorism Database <http://www.start.umd.edu/gtd/search/IncidentSummary.aspx?gtdid=199112000001> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁷⁷ Chronology of the Web site of Azerbaijan’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs: http://mfa.gov.az/eng/kh_ojaly_en/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=25&Itemid=39 (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

to death twice” by his irresponsible statements) was replaced by the pragmatic Roland Dumas; one of the first trips of Mr. Dumas was in Turkey. The Minister of Internal Affairs Gaston Defferre, Mayor of Marseille (a city with a strong Armenian community) kept only decentralization, which was his main project, and was replaced by Pierre Joxe, an intransigent partisan of rule of law. Étienne Manac’h (1910-1992), former professor at Galatasaray Lisesi (1938-1941), delegate of the Free French Forces in Ankara (1942-1943) and ambassador (1945-1975), was sent as a special delegate to Turkey by President Mitterrand to ameliorate the bilateral relations, which were almost completely frozen in the beginning of 1984.

As a result, there was a deal between François Mitterrand, the Turkish Ambassador Adnan Bulak, and Jean Loyrette, principal of Gide-Loyrette-Nouel firm law (the second best French firm law at the time, and currently the first)⁷⁸ and Counsel of the French Ministry of Foreign affairs. For the precedent trials (Max Kilndjian 1982, Abraham Thomassian 1983, the attackers of the Turkish consulate 1984), the Turkish diplomatic corps paid famous lawyers, but gave no (1982, 1983) or too few (1984) arguments about the tragedy of World War I. Mr. Loyrette is not only one of the best French lawyers of the 20th century, but he also has a Ph.D. in contemporary history, obtained from Oxford University, a degree which placed him in a better position than other advocates to argue about historical controversies.

In December 1984 and January 1985, during two separate trials of terrorists, where the Turkish side was represented by Mr. Loyrette and his firm, the change in situation showed itself. Charged for illegal storing of explosives, Avétis Catanessian was sentenced to four years of jail (more than Mr. Thomassian, who was charged for bombing, in 1983). Other terrorists were sentenced to two or three years in jail, for the same charge, or for concealment of a criminal.

What Happened in the Créteil’s Criminal Court

For the trial of the Orly attack (February-March 1985), organized in Créteil (Parisian East suburb) the DST agreed with the Turkish Embassy to prevent nationalist Armenians of attending the trial and to intimidate the tribunal. Only Turks and French were allowed to attend in the room. A significant protection device was deployed. There was nothing like the hysterical crowd of Kilndjian trial, or the very mixed audiences (Turks and ASALA’s sympathizers) who attended the trials of December 1984 and January 1985.

⁷⁸ Official Web site of the firm, English version: <http://www.gide.com/front/EN/home.htm> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

The plaintiffs had three lawyers: Gilles de Poix and Christian de Thezillat, associates of Jean Loyrette, argued to find the three indicted persons guilty; Jean Loyrette himself argued against the Armenian terrorism and the “Armenian genocide” allegation. Mr. Loyrette stressed the use of fake evidence (the “Andonian documents” and the quotation attributed to Hitler) and on the release of the Turkish top-ranking officials interned in Malta by the British authorities from 1919 to 1921. He also pointed out correctly that “the three books (Carzou, Chaliand, Ternon) which are constantly used in the Armenian trials and in the tracts of small revolutionary groups are the works of amateurs, who do not have a real education of historians, ignores the Turkish language, and never refer to any Turkish document, even to criticize it. They have a responsibility in this work of disinformation, and this responsibility is especially heavy since they know perfectly that, in front of the magnitude of the tragedy, the passions run high.” To reinforce this argumentation, four Turkish scholars — Sina Akşin, Türkkaya Ataöv, Hasan Köni and Mümtaz Soysal — testified against the “genocide” allegations; Avedis Simon Haciniyian, senior lecturer at the Bosphorus University, testified against the allegation of “persecution” of Armenians in Turkey.⁷⁹

Jean-Marie Carzou, Gérard Chaliand and Yves Ternon, accustomed to tribunal rooms since 1981, did not dare to participate at the trial as witnesses of defense, likely due to the enormity of the crime, possibly also because they were afraid of the cross-examination by Jean Loyrette. Especially, if he would have participated in the trial, Mr. Ternon would have been almost certainly interrogated about his use, as a defense witness during the ASALA trial of January 1984, of a quotation attributed to Atatürk, which was proven to be a fake by the Dashnak intellectual James H. Tashjian.⁸⁰ Mr. Carzou would have risked being interrogated about his false allegation regarding the “Andonian documents”⁸¹: he claimed that these documents were accepted as authentic by the criminal court which judged Slogomon Tehlirian, the assassin of Talat

⁷⁹ *Terrorist Attack at Orly: Statements and Evidence Presented at the Trial, February 19 - March 2, 1985*, (Ankara: Faculty of Political Science, 1985). The original French version is available online: <http://www.tetedeturc.com/home/spip.php?article96> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁸⁰ Türkkaya Ataöv, *Armenian Falsifications*, (New York: Okey, 2008), pp. 44-53.

⁸¹ Aram Andonian (ed.), *Documents officiels concernant les massacres arméniens*, (Paris: Imprimerie H. Turabian, 1920). English version: *The Memoirs of Naim Bey. Turkish Official Documents Relating to the Deportation and Massacres of Armenians*, (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1920). For a detailed demonstration that these “documents” are forgeries, see Şinasi Orel and Sürreya Yuca, *The Talât Pasha Telegrams. Historical Fact or Armenian Fiction?*, Nicosia-London, K. Rüstem & Brothers/Oxford University Press, 1986, <http://www.eraren.org/index.php?Lisan=en&Page=YayinIcerik&SayiNo=15> (Accessed on June 7, 2011). See also Maxime Gauin, ‘Aram Andonian’s ‘Memoirs of Naim Bey’ and the Contemporary Attempts to Defend their ‘Authenticity’,’ *Review of Armenian Studies*, n° 23, 2011, pp. 233-292.

Pasha.⁸² Actually, the German prosecutor expressed deep skepticism about the authenticity of these “documents”, and the defense renounced to use this more than dubious material.⁸³ Nevertheless, the books of the trio Carzou-Chaliand-Ternon were used, among others, by the lawyers of defense for the Orly trial. There was real controversy, and the plaintiffs’ side was largely the winner.

However, on a purely legal level, the defense initially had some advantages. Indeed, in 1985 (it changed as early as 1986), the French law did not authorize restricting the release, during the trial, of the methods of investigation used against terrorists; all the conditions of the research of evidences had to be mentioned during the trial. So, the DST refrained from exposing all the material in the legal file, being afraid that other terrorists, including members of ASALA, could use such information to prepare future attacks with more cover. As a result, even the principal perpetrator of attack, Waroujan Garbidjian, was sentenced as an accomplice, not as an assassin.⁸⁴

So, if Mr. Garbidjian was sentenced to life, it was not only because the majority of the victims killed was non-Turks, but also because the plaintiffs were able to efficiently challenge the “genocide” claims. As said rightfully by Justin McCarthy, history is both poison and antidote for the Armenian terrorism.⁸⁵

Because of the bitterness of Hagop Hagopian, chief of the ASALA, against his former comrade Jean-Marc “Ara” Toranian, the three terrorists charged for the Orly attack refused the help of the CSPPA, and chose as their main Counsel Jacques Vergès — in addition to Christian Bourguet, Raffi Pechdimaldjian and Michel Zavrian. Mr. Vergès was the lawyer of Palestinian and pro-Palestinian terrorists since 1960’s, and also defended the war criminal Klaus Barbie⁸⁶, so this choice was in fact a handicap more than an advisable decision.

The single error of the Turkish side during the period between the mid-1984 and 1986 was to sue Mr. Toranian only for concealment of a criminal, and not

⁸² Jean-Marie Carzou, *Arménie 1915 : un génocide exemplaire*, (Paris: Flammarion, 1975), p. 248.

⁸³ Ara Krikorian (ed.), *Justicier du génocide arménien : le procès Tehlirian*, (Marseille : Diasporas, 1981), pp. 137-139 and 161.

⁸⁴ Text of the verdict: https://www.unodc.org/tldb/pdf/France_CAValdeMarne_1985.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁸⁵ Justin McCarthy, ‘Armenian Terrorism: History as Poison and as Antidote,’ *International Terrorism and the Drug Connection*, (Ankara: Ankara University Press), pp. 85-94, http://www.tc-america.org/terrorism_mccarthy.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011). See also Kemal Çiçek, ‘Relocation of the Armenians in 1915: A Reassessment,’ *Review of Armenian Studies*, n° 22, 2010, pp. 115-133; Michael M. Gunter, *Armenian History and the Question of Genocide*, (New York-London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2011); Yusuf Halaçoğlu, *The Story of 1915. What Happened to the Ottoman Armenians?*, (Ankara: TTK, 2008); Guenter Lewy, *The Armenian Massacres in Ottoman Turkey*, (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press), 2005; and Gilles Veinstein, ‘Trois questions sur un massacre’, *L’Histoire*, April 1995.

⁸⁶ Barbet Schröder, *L’Avocat de la terreur*, documentary film, 2007.

for glorification of terrorism and outrage to magistrates. Many articles of his newspaper *Hay Baykar* offered occasions for such court cases.

The Meaning of the Créteil Trial

France frequently received a tough criticism for its attitude vis-à-vis the Armenian terrorism.⁸⁷ Such criticism has some factual basis, but forgets the specificity of the French case and underestimates the effectiveness of the global, rational strategy adopted in mid-1984 by the Turkish side, in full accord with the French government. The excess of this criticism can be explained by both the incomprehension of the Turks in front of the attitude of their older ally and an anti-French prejudice, not unusual in the Anglo-Saxon world, including from some respectable scholars and journalists. The focus on France also forgets the even more questionable attitude of Austria, the country which was the host of the ARF congress deciding the return to terrorism in 1972. Austria was never able to arrest a single Armenian terrorist, or to effectively protect the Turkish diplomats working on its soil.

There were actually no fundamental — but only conjectural — reasons for the crisis of 1981-1984; there was no mainstream prejudice in France which could be compared to the Protestant fundamentalism in the USA and Germany until today, in the UK at the time of William Gladstone and David Lloyd George.⁸⁸ Unlike the US tribunals which sentenced Gourgen Yanikian and Hampig Sassounian to life, the French juries and magistrates were sensitive to the “genocide” charge and to the intimidation by fanatic Armenians; when the coherent strategy of the Armenian nationalists was challenged by an equally coherent strategy, the verdicts became different. Unfortunately, the effective solutions used for the Orly trial and dismantlement of the Armenian terrorism in France were not pursued later, by Turkey and its supporters, to fight the “recognition”.

The “Recognition” of the So-Called “Genocide”, or Rewarding Terrorism

Soner Nayir, sentenced to 15 years, served more than 11 years in jail, i.e. roughly three quarters of his sentence.⁸⁹ Almost no convict serves more than the three quarters of his sentence in France, since the end of 19th century. Similarly, the

⁸⁷ For instance: *Armenian Terrorism...*; Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, pp. 103-108; Stephen Segaller, *Invisible armies...*, p. 73. See also the contra-argumentation of Jacques Léauté, ‘Terrorism: Action and Reaction,’ in *International Terrorism and the Drug Connection*, (Ankara: Ankara University Press), pp. 289-294.

⁸⁸ Justin McCarthy, *The Turk in America. The Creation of an Enduring Prejudice*, (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press), 2010; Jeremy Salt, *Imperialism, Evangelism and the Ottoman Armenians (1878-1896)*, (London-Portland: Frank Cass), 1993; Stanford J. Shaw, *The Ottoman Empire in World War I*, (Ankara: TTK), tome II, 2008, pp. 1113-1142.

⁸⁹ ‘Soner Nayir libéré’, *Les Nouvelles d’Arménie magazine*, n° 1, mars 1995.

ASALA-RM's leader Monte Melkonian, sentenced to six years, including two suspended, served more than three years (November 1985-January 1989).⁹⁰ So, it is not possible to say that, from the end of 1984 to the middle of 1990's, the Armenian terrorists convicted by French justice benefited of a lax enforcement of sentences.

Regardless, the "recognition" of "Armenian genocide" claims by the French Parliament (1998-2001), which, incidentally, violated the Constitution⁹¹, changed the situation. Not surprisingly Yves Ternon, the veteran of ASALA trials, was one of the main persons who testified in front of the subcommittee of the National Assembly studying the "recognition" (1998). Mr. Ternon actually had nothing to fear: the subcommittee was formed only by parliamentarians elected thanks to the support of nationalist Armenian associations. It is needless to say that no one historian specializing in Turkish and Ottoman history was invited to testify in front of this subcommittee. To obtain the vote of the Senate, much more reluctant than the National Assembly, the France's Armenian associations organized such a virulent and aggressive demonstration that *Le Monde*, however favorable to the "recognition", feared a comeback of Armenian terrorism.

The final adoption of the law (January 2001) permitted an exceptionally mild treatment for Mr. Garbidjian. His new lawyers used as argument the "recognition" to obtain, with success in 2001, his liberation by the *tribunal d'application des peines* (parole board)⁹², despite that the terrorists did not present regrets or apologies.⁹³ Patrick Arapian, the main counsel of the Armenian Revolutionary Federation in France — and a former associate of Jacques Vergès — played a prominent role in this release.⁹⁴ If an evidence of ARF's real opinion about the Orly case was still needed, this fact would furnish it.

⁹⁰ 'Libération du militant arménien Monte Melkonian', *Le Monde*, 17 janvier 1989.

⁹¹ Georges Vedel, 'Les questions de constitutionnalité posées par la loi du 29 janvier 2001', in Didier Mauss and Jeanette Bougrab (ed.), *François Luchaire, un républicain au service de la République*, (Paris : Publications de la Sorbonne, 2005), pp. 37-61. See also the deposition of Senator Robert Badinter, former minister of Justice (1981-1986) and president of Constitutional Council (1986-1995) in front of the Accoyer sub-committee, 2008: http://www.assemblee-nationale.fr/13/rap-info/i1262.asp#P4036_1545373 (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁹² 'Le terroriste Garbidjian quitte les prisons françaises', *Libération*, April 24, 2001, <http://www.liberation.fr/societe/0101371618-le-terroriste-garbidjian-quitte-les-prisons-francaises> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁹³ See this interview of 2008: http://www.armworld.am/detail.php?paperid=3029&pageid=96105&lang=_eng (Accessed on May 2, 2011).

⁹⁴ 'Les Arméniens de Géorgie, victimes d'un 'plan concerté de discrimination'', *France-Arménie*, December 16, 2008, <http://www.yerkir.eu/2008.11.16%20-%20FA%20-%20Interview%20Patrick%20Arapian.pdf> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

Waroujan Garbidjian was released after less than 18 years in prison. A comparison with similar cases of 1980's is self-explanatory. The far left terrorists of Action directe sentenced to life for murder (one or two murders for every) served more than twenty years, excepted Joëlle Aubron (18 years), released for serious health reasons.⁹⁵ Similarly, the far right terrorist Michel Lajoie, sentenced to life for a bombing which did not kill or wound anybody (despite the intent of this criminal) served twenty years. The Lebanese terrorist Georges Ibrahim Abdallah, sentenced for his participation in the murder of two diplomats (one American, Robert Day, and one Israeli, Yacov Barsimantov) is in jail since 1984, with very few hopes of release.⁹⁶ The Islamist Tunisian terrorist Fouad Ali Saleh, sentenced to life for several bloody attacks in Paris, is in jail since 1987.

Even more remarkable is the silence in France and the reactions in Armenia. Except an article in the daily *Libération*, the release of this terrorist provoked very few reactions in the main French medias outlets, and even less in the French political world. Waroujan Garbidjian, despite his Syrian citizenship, was kindly expelled to Armenia.⁹⁷ He was welcomed in Yerevan by the actual Prime Minister, Antranik Markarian, and by the mayor of Armenia's capital, Robert Nazarian, who pledged to provide him with employment and accommodation.⁹⁸ This attitude was by no means exceptional. Mardiros Jamgotchian, member of the ASALA and assassin of Mehmet S. Yergüz, secretary of Turkish consulate in Geneva⁹⁹, was welcomed in Armenia the Armenian Benevolent Association "Gtutiu" — the very first NGO created in Armenia — after his release from a Swiss prison, in 1991.¹⁰⁰ The four attackers of the Paris consulate immigrated in

⁹⁵ For instance 21 years for Nathalie Ménigon, 23 years for Maxime Frérot, 24 years for Georges Cipriani, 26 years for Régis Schleicher. 'Nathalie Ménigon sort de prison', *Lefigaro.fr*, August 2, 2008, <http://www.lefigaro.fr/actualite-france/2008/08/02/01016-20080802ARTFIG00418-nathalie-menigon-sort-de-prison-.php> ; 'Semi-liberté pour Régis Schleicher', *20 minutes*, July 23, 2009 <http://www.20minutes.fr/article/339707/France-Semi-liberte-pour-Regis-Schleicher.php>; 'Action directe : Frérot est libre', *Lejdd.fr*, July 2, 2010, <http://www.lejdd.fr/Societe/Justice/Actualite/Action-Directe-Ferot-est-libre-204520/> (Accessed on May 4, 2011).

⁹⁶ 'France : Georges Ibrahim Abdallah ne sera pas libéré', *20 minutes*, May 5, 2009. <http://www.20minutes.fr/article/324193/France-Georges-Ibrahim-Abdallah-ne-sera-pas-libere.php> (Accessed on May 4, 2011).

⁹⁷ 'Le terroriste Garbidjian...'

⁹⁸ *Radio Free Europe*, May 7, 2001, <http://www.rferl.org/content/article/1142396.html> Armenews, May 5, 2001, http://www.armenews.com/article.php3?id_article=776 (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

⁹⁹ Michael M. Gunter, *Pursuing the Just...*, pp. 70-71; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome I, pp. 408-422. On the Armenian support to Mardiros Jamgotchian after his arrest and during his trial in 1981, see also Gaïdz Minassian, *Guerre et terrorisme...*, p. 57; Jean-Pierre Richardot, *Arméniens, quoi qu'il en coûte*, (Paris: Fayard, 1982), pp. 106-109; Bilâl N. Şimşir, *Şehit Diplomatlarımız...*, tome I, pp. 420-421.

¹⁰⁰ Letter of Gtutiu, April 8, 1991. I express my thanks to Sevil Kaplun, who sent to me a copy of this document.

Armenia after the independence; and as late as 2010, the Armenian Ministry of Culture supported financially the publication of a book glorifying the attack, and presented to the press by its author, Grigor Janikyan, with two of the perpetrators.¹⁰¹

In France, the main Armenian associations threw definitely unmasked themselves in 2003, when Mr. Toranian was elected as president of Coordination Council of France's Armenian Association (CCAF). He spent four years in this presidency, and was reelected in 2010 as co-president, together with the Dashnak Mourad Papazian, who was the most strident supporter of JCAG/ARA in France during the 1980s.¹⁰² Mr. Toranian published on May 3, 2007, a "tribute to Monte Melkonian", and then hoped — in his speech of April 24, 2009 — the return of "the activism of the 1975-1980 years".¹⁰³ So, there is definitely no clear line between the Armenian activism, in France and several other countries, and Armenian terrorism. *The Wall Street Journal* appropriately called the approbation, in September 1984, of the resolution designating April 24 as "National Day of Remembrance of Man's Inhumanity to Man" as "ASALA's Day".¹⁰⁴ The "recognition" of "Armenian genocide" claims in France was another "ASALA's Day", in every aspect.

CONCLUSION: CRIMES AND DOUBLE STANDARDS

In a letter to President Woodrow Wilson dated March 23, 1920, colonel Charles Furlong, an Army intelligence officer and U.S. Delegate to the Paris Peace Conference, elaborated: "We hear much, both truth and gross exaggeration of Turkish massacres of Armenians, but little or nothing of the Armenian massacres of Turks. [...] Our opportunity to gain the esteem and respect of the Muslim world [...] will depend much on whether America hears Turkey's untrammled voice and evidence which she has never succeeded in placing before the Court of Nations."¹⁰⁵ Similarly, in several telegrams to French War

¹⁰¹ Hetq Online, December 2, 2010, <http://old.hetq.am/en/society/van/> (Accessed on May 6, 2011)

¹⁰² For example: 'L'affaire Kilndjian' ou la justice mise en cause', *Haïastan*, September-October 1980, pp. 7-8; 'Coupable ou non, nous soutenons Hampig Sassounian', *Haïastan*, May 1982, pp. 7-9; 'L'A.R.A. frappe à Vienne', *Haïastan*, December 1984, p. 10.

¹⁰³ *Armenews*, May 3, 2007, and April 24, 2009, http://www.armenews.com/article.php3?id_article=31647 http://www.armenews.com/article.php3?id_article=51255 (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

¹⁰⁴ 'ASALA's Day,' *The Wall Street Journal*, October 2, 1984, p. 30. See also, 'Unraveling the Motivations for Armenian Terror,' *The Wall Street Journal*, August 3, 1983 and 'Armenian Terror Tactics,' *The Washington Post*, July 31, 1983.

¹⁰⁵ Quoted in Bruce Fein, 'Armenia Crime Amnesia?', *The Washington Times*, October 16, 2007, http://www.turkishcoalition.org/media/fein_wt.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011). See also Laurence Evans, *United States Policy and the Partition of Turkey. 1914-1924*, (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press), 1965, pp. 272-273; Yücel Güçlü, *Armenians and the Allies in Cilicia. 1914-1923*, (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2005), pp. 112-114 and 124-127; and Justin

Office, especially on February 2, February 28 and March 5, 1919, General Jules Hamelin, chief of the French armies in the Near East in 1918-1919, warned that the crimes perpetrated by Armenian soldiers were not less cruel than crimes perpetrated by Turks and Kurds, that these crimes would damage the image of France in the Muslim world, and that France would never be awarded by any gratitude from Armenian groups, who saw Hamelin's country only as a source of money and a military force.¹⁰⁶

These warnings have always been neglected by these numerous politicians who pretend write history for their own political purpose, and electoral interest. But, in addition to these double standards regarding war crimes, the Turks suffered double standard on terrorism. No monument or plaque commemorates the Orly bombing, already largely forgotten. However, after the assassination of Hrant Dink, his name was given to two streets of Lyon and the main city of Lyon's suburb, Villeurbanne, only to satisfy ultra-nationalist organizations which hated the deeds of Hrant Dink but now use his assassination for their political agenda. The British Armenian historian Ara Sarafian pointed correctly that "Those who accused Dink of being a Turkish agent made him a hero."¹⁰⁷

The free speech in Turkey regarding the Armenian issue is so far that Khatchig Mouradian, the editor-in-chief of the Dashnak *Armenian Weekly* — a newspaper which praised, as we saw, Armenian terrorism, after having praised the Armenian branch of Nazism¹⁰⁸ — was allowed to make a speech in Ankara. He spoke about the so-called "reparations" which Turkey is supposed to have to pay¹⁰⁹ — without any legal basis.¹¹⁰ However, Turkey is still presented in the EU and USA as a country restricting free speech on the Armenian issue. On the other hand, almost no protest came from the West in 2009, when the association of ASALA's veterans silenced the Australian-Armenian scholar

McCarthy, 'The Report of Niles and Sutherland,' in *XI. Türk Tarih Kongresi*, (Ankara: TTK, 1994), tome V, pp. 1809-1853. http://louisville.edu/a-s/history/turks/Niles_and_Sutherland.pdf (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

¹⁰⁶ Archives du ministère des Affaires étrangères, P 1426.

¹⁰⁷ 'A Common Enemy Who is Called Hate,' *Turkish Daily News*, April 26, 2008, <http://arama.hurriyet.com.tr/arsivnews.aspx?id=-628762> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

¹⁰⁸ Arthur Derounian, 'The Armenian Displaced Persons,' *Armenian Affairs Magazine*, I-1, Winter 1949-1950, <http://www.tallarmeniantale.com/derounian-dashnak-dominat.htm> (Accessed on May 6, 2011); Ayhan Özer, 'The Armenian-Nazi Collaboration in WWII,' *The Turkish Times*, July 15, 1996 <http://www.ataa.org/reference/nazi-ozar.html> (Accessed on May 6, 2011); see also Christopher Walker, *Armenia. The Survival of a Nation*, (London: Routledge), 1990, p. 357. *The Armenian Weekly* was at that time named *Hairenik Weekly*.

¹⁰⁹ 'Mouradian: Ankara Conference Looks Beyond Genocide, Debates Reparations,' *The Armenian Weekly* online, April 28, 2010, <http://www.armenianweekly.com/2010/04/28/ankara-conference/> (Accessed on May 6, 2011)

¹¹⁰ Kemal Çiçek, 'The 1934-1935 Turkish-American Compensation Agreement and Its Implication for Today,' *Review of Armenian Studies*, n° 23, 2010, pp. 93-115.

Armen Gakavian, who wanted to launch a petition of apology for the Armenian terrorism of the 1970s and 1980s, and for the war crimes of Armenian soldiers and volunteers of Russian army during WWI.¹¹¹

Finally, let's notice that while the — mostly moderate — Muslims of Western countries are frequently criticized by xenophobes for their supposed lack of condemnation of terrorism — an unfair accusation for the majority, it is needless to say that —, almost no non-Turkish groups or individuals ask the Armenians to condemn the terrorism. The ASALA terrorist Vazgen Sislian argued in 2010 that “Luckily, 99% of the Diaspora supported those actions and the mood in Soviet Armenia was also positive.”¹¹² Mr. Sislian's figure is surely an exaggeration; but not even 1% of Armenians, outside of Turkey, demonstrated by public statements against Armenian terrorism that Mr. Sislian was wrong.¹¹³

REFERENCES

- ‘A Common Enemy who is Called Hate’, *Turkish Daily News*, April 26, 2008.
‘Action directe : Frérot est libre’, *Lejdd.fr*, July 2, 2010.
‘L’agenda’, *France-Arménie*, July 16, 2008.
Andonian, Aram, (ed.), *Documents officiels concernant les massacres arméniens*, (Paris : Imprimerie H. Turabian, 1920). English version : *The Memoirs of Naim Bey. Turkish Official Documents Relating to the Deportation and Massacres of Armenians*, (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1920).
Alexander, Yonah and Sinai, Joshua, *Terrorism: the PLO Connection*, (New York-Bristol: C. Russak/Taylor & Francis), 1989.
Andrew, Christopher and Mitrokhin, Vasili, *The World Was Going Our Way: The KGB Battle for the Third World*, (New York: Basic Books, 2005).
Arıĝ, Ayten Sezer, ‘Diaspora Armenians Who Are Friends of Turks,’ in Metin Hülagü (ed.), *Armenians in the Ottoman Society*, (Kayseri: Erciyes University, 2006), tome I, pp. 237-251.
Armenian Atrocities and Terrorism, (Washington: ATAA, 1997).
Armenian Terrorism and the Paris Trial, (University of Ankara, 1984).
‘Les Arméniens de Géorgie, victimes d’un “plan concerté de discrimination’, *France-Arménie*, December 16, 2008.

¹¹¹ ‘Ermeni aydınlar da harekete geçiyor,’ *Radikal*, February 1st, 2009, <http://www.radikal.com.tr/Radikal.aspx?aType=RadikalDetayV3&ArticleID=919591&Date=02.02.2009&CategoryID=77>; ‘ASALA Threatens Gakavian over Apology Initiative,’ *Today's Zaman*, February 13, 2009 <http://todayszaman.com/news-166849-asala-threatens-gakavian-over-apology-initiative.html> (Accessed on May 6, 2011).

¹¹² See note 101.

¹¹³ About these exceptions, and the pressures against them, see Ayten Sezer Arıĝ, ‘Diaspora Armenians Who Are Friends of Turks,’ in Metin Hülagü (ed.), *Armenians in the Ottoman Society*, (Kayseri: Erciyes University, 2006), tome I, pp. 237-251, <http://armenians-1915.blogspot.com/2007/01/1346-diaspora-armenians-who-are-friends.html> (Accessed on June 7, 2011)

- 'ASALA's A. Yenikomshian Addresses New Year's Message to Armenians,' *The Armenian Reporter*, January 26, 1982.
- 'ASALA's Day,' *The Wall Street Journal*, October 2, 1984.
- 'L'ASALA sur et contre elle-même', *Notes et Études de L'institut de Criminologie de Paris*, n° 11-12, October 1989.
- 'ASALA Threatens Gakavian over Apology Initiative,' *Today's Zaman*, February 13, 2009.
- Aspirations et agissements révolutionnaires des comités arméniens, avant et après la proclamation de la Constitution ottomane*, (Istanbul : Matbaai Orhaniye, 1917).
- Sarkis Atamian, *The Armenian Community. The Historical Development of a Social and Ideological Conflict*, (New York: Philosophical Library, 1955).
- Ataöv, Türkkaya, *Armenian Falsifications*, (New York: Okey, 2008).
- Bobelian, Michael, *Children of Armenia*, (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2009).
- Çağaptay, Soner, "Can the PKK Renounce to Violence? Terrorism Resurgent," *The Middle East Quarterly*, Vol. XIV, n° 1, Winter 2007, pp. 45-52.
- Carzou, Jean-Marie, *Arménie 1915 : un génocide exemplaire*, (Paris: Flammarion, 1975).
- Chronology of Armenian terrorist attacks on the Web site of Azerbaijan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs: http://mfa.gov.az/eng/khojaly_en/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=25&Itemid=39
- Çiçek, Kemal, 'Relocation of the Armenians in 1915: A Reassessment,' *Review of Armenian Studies*, n° 22, 2010, pp. 115-133.
- Çiçek, Kemal, 'The 1934-1935 Turkish-American Compensation Agreement and Its Implication for Today,' *Review of Armenian Studies*, n° 23, 2010, pp. 93-115.
- Comité de soutien à Max Kilndjian, *Les Arméniens en cour d'assises. Terroristes ou résistants ?*, (Marseille: Parenthèses, 1983).
- 'Community Remembers Sacrifice of Lisbon 5,' *Asbarez*, August 1, 2008.
- Hratch Dasnabedian, 'The Hnchakian Party,' *Armenian Review*, XLI-4, Winter 1988, pp. 17-39.
- 'La dérive sanglante de l'ASALA', *Le Nouvel Observateur*, October 17, 1986, p. 46.
- Derounian, Arthur, "The Armenian Displaced Persons," *Armenian Affairs Magazine*, I-1, Winter 1949-1950.
- 'Dix ans de lutte armée', *Haiastan*, December 1985.
- 'Ermeni Aydınlar da Harekete Geçiyor,' *Radikal*, February 1, 2009.
- Evans, Laurence, *United States Policy and the Partition of Turkey. 1914-1924*, (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1965).
- Fein, Bruce, 'Armenia Crime Amnesia?', *The Washington Times*, October 16, 2007.
- 'France : Georges Ibrahim Abdallah ne sera pas libéré', *20 minutes*, May 5, 2009.
- Gaspard (Gasparian), Armand, *Le Combat Arménien*, (Lausanne: L'Âge d'homme, 1984).
- Gauin, Maxime, 'Aram Andonian's 'Memoirs of Naim Bey' and the Contemporary Attempts to Defend their 'Authenticity'', *Review of Armenian Studies*, n° 23, 2011, pp. 233-292.
- Gazigiray, A. Alper, *Ermeni Terörü'nün Kaynakları*, (İstanbul: Gözen Kitabevi, 1982).
- Güçlü, Yücel, *Armenians and the Allies in Cilicia. 1914-1923*, (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2005).
- Gunter, Michael M., "Pursuing the Just Cause of their People". *A Study of Contemporary Armenian Terrorism*, (Westport-New York-London: Greenwood Press, 1986).
- Gunter, Michael M., "Transnational Sources of Support for the Kurdish Insurgency in Turkey," *Conflict Quarterly*, n° 11, Spring 1991, pp. 16-22.

- Gunter, Michael M., *Armenian History and the Question of Genocide*, (New York-London: Palgrave MacMillan, 2011).
- Gürün, Kâmuran, *The Armenian File. The Myth of Innocence Exposed*, (İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, 2007) (1st English edition, Nicosia, 1985).
- Hagopian, John D., 'We Will Never Forget,' *The Armenian Reporter*, January 23 1982.
- Halaçoğlu, Yusuf, *The Story of 1915. What Happened to the Ottoman Armenians?*, (Ankara: TTK, 2008).
- 'HONGRIE — L'ambassadeur de Turquie échappe à un attentat', *Le Monde*, December 21, 1991.
- 'HONGRIE — Deux policiers blessés dans un attentat visant des juifs soviétiques', *Le Monde*, December 25, 1991.
- Hyland, Francis P., *Armenian Terrorism: the Past, the Present, the Prospects*, (Boulder-San Francisco-Oxford: Westview Press, 1991).
- International Terrorism and the Drug Connection*, (Ankara: Ankara University Press, 1984).
- Khaligian, Aram, 'The Necessities of Violence and National Culture in the Liberation Struggle,' *The Armenian Weekly*, December 31, 1986, p. 15.
- Krikorian, Ara, (ed.), *Justicier du génocide arménien : le procès Tehlirian*, (Marseille : Diasporas, 1981).
- Laçiner, Sedat, 'Drug Smuggling as Main Source of PKK Terrorism,' *The Journal of Turkish Weekly*, October 18, 2008.
- Laçiner, Sedat, *Ermeni Sorunu, Diaspora ve Türk Dış Politikası*, (Ankara: USAK, 2008).
- Langer, William L., *The Diplomacy of Imperialism: 1890-1902*, (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1960).
- Lewis, Bernard, 'Muslim Anti-Semitism,' *The Middle East Quarterly*, Vol. V, n° 2, June 1998, pp. 43-49.
- Lewy, Guenter, *The Armenian Massacres in Ottoman Turkey*, (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2005).
- 'Libération du militant arménien Monte Melkonian', *Le Monde*, 17 janvier 1989.
- Heath Lowry, 'Chronological Breakdown of Armenian Terrorist Incidents, 1973-1987,' in *Armenian Allegations: Myth and Reality. A Handbook of facts and Documents*, (Washington: ATAA, 1987).
- Mango, Andrew, *Turkey and the War on Terror. For Forty Years We Fought Alone*, (London-New York: Routledge), 2005.
- McCarthy, Justin, "The Report of Niles and Sutherland," in *XI. Türk Tarih Kongresi*, (Ankara: TTK, 1994), tome V, pp. 1809-1853.
- McCarthy, Justin, *The Turk in America. The Creation of an Enduring Prejudice*, (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press), 2010.
- Minassian, Gaïdz, *Guerre et terrorisme arméniens*, (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 2002).
- 'Mise au point et bilan de sept années d'actions armées', *Haiastan*, October 1982.
- Moorad Mooradian, 'Turkish Groups' Stereotyping Old Hat for Deniers,' *The Armenian Mirror-Spectator*, March 25, 2000.
- 'Mouradian: Ankara Conference Looks Beyond Genocide, Debates Reparations,' *The Armenian Weekly* online, April 28, 2010.
- 'Nathalie Ménigon sort de prison', *Lefigaro.fr*, August 2, 2008.

- Nalbandian, Louise, *The Armenian Revolutionary Movement. The Development of Armenian Political Parties Through the Nineteenth Century*, (Berkeley-Los Angeles-London: University of California Press), 1963.
- Orel, Şinasi and Yuca, Sürreya, *The Talât Pasha Telegrams. Historical Fact or Armenian Fiction?*, (Nicosia-London: K. Rüstem & Brothers/Oxford University Press, 1986).
- Özer, Ayhan, "The Armenian-Nazi Collaboration in WWII," *The Turkish Times*, July 15, 1996.
- Papazian, Kapriel Serope, *Patriotism Perverted*, (Boston: Baikar Press, 1934).
- Papazian, Mourad, "L'affaire Kilindjian" ou la justice mise en cause', *Haiïastan*, September-October 1980, pp. 7-8.
- Papazian, Mourad, 'Coupable ou non, nous soutenons Hampig Sassounian', *Haiïastan*, May 1982, pp. 7-9.
- Papazian, Mourad, 'L'A.R.A. frappe à Vienne', *Haiïastan*, December 1984, p. 10.
- Richardot, Jean-Pierre, *Arméniens, quoi qu'il en coûte*, (Paris: Fayard, 1982).
- Salt, Jeremy, *Imperialism, Evangelism and the Ottoman Armenians (1878-1896)*, (London-Portland: Frank Cass, 1993).
- Segaller, Stephen, *Invisible Armies. Terrorism into the 1990's*, (London: Sphere Books/Penguin Books, 1987).
- 'Semi-liberté pour Régis Schleicher', *20 minutes*, July 23, 2009.
- Stanford J. Shaw, *The Ottoman Empire in World War I*, (Ankara: TTK), tome II, 2008.
- Şimşir, Bilâl N., *Şehit Diplomatlarımız (1973-1994)*, (Ankara: Bilgi Yayınevi, 2000).
- 'Soner Nayir libéré', *Les Nouvelles d'Arménie magazine*, n° 1, mars 1995.
- Sterling, Claire, *The Terror Network: The Secret War of International Terrorism*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1981).
- Terrorist Attack at Orly: Statements and Evidence Presented at the Trial, February 19 - March 2, 1985*, (Ankara: Faculty of Political Science, 1985).
- 'Le terroriste Garbidjian quitte les prisons françaises', *Libération*, April 24, 2001.
- Pierre Terzian, 'La question arménienne aujourd'hui', *Critique socialiste*, n° 44, 1982.
- 'Topalian Charged With Pursuing Armenian Cause by Force', *Asbarez*, October 19, 1999.
- 'Topalian Defense Committee Established', *Asbarez*, December 3, 1999.
- '\$25,000 Raised for Topalian Fund during the Fresno Independence Event', *Asbarez*, June 2, 2000.
- 'Un représentant de Boris Eltsine tué dans le Caucase du Nord', *Le Monde*, August 3, 1993.
- 'Unraveling the Motivations for Armenian Terror', *The Wall Street Journal*, August 3, 1983.
- Valyi, Felix, *Spiritual and Political Revolutions in Islam*, (London: Kegan Paul, 1925).
- Varandian, Mikael, *L'Arménie et la question arménienne*, (Laval: G. Kavanagh & Cie), 1917.
- Vedel, Georges, 'Les questions de constitutionnalité posées par la loi du 29 janvier 2001', in Didier Mauss and Jeanette Bougrab (ed.), *François Luchaire, un républicain au service de la République*, (Paris : Publications de la Sorbonne, 2005), pp. 37-61.
- Veinstein, Gilles, 'Trois questions sur un massacre', *L'Histoire*, April 1995.
- Christopher Walker, *Armenia. The Survival of a Nation*, (London: Routledge, 1990).